



External Peer Review Requirements for Those Pursuing Tenure and/or Promotion

(Effective from Fall 2024, Approved by College Council: 5/13/24)

Table of Contents

External Peer Review Requirement for Those Pursuing Tenure and/or Promotion	3
Guidelines for Identifying Possible External Peer Reviewers	3
Materials to Be Provided to External Peer Reviewers	4
Criteria for External Peer Reviewers	4
Timeline for Requesting Evaluations from External Peer Reviewers	4
Confidentiality of Letters from External Peer Reviewers	5
Special Considerations	5
Concurrent Promotion with Tenure	5
Appendix A: External Peer Reviewer Request Letter for Tenure Candidates	6
Appendix B: External Peer Reviewer Request Letter for Assistant Professors Being Considered for Tenure and Concurrent Promotion	8
Appendix C: External Peer Reviewers Request Letter for Associate Professors Being Considered for Promotion to Full Professor	10
Medgar Evers College Tenure and Promotion Review Committee Members	12

External Peer Review Requirement for Those Pursuing Tenure and/or Promotion

For reappointment with tenure or for promotion to Associate, Full, or Distinguished Professor, at least four external peer reviews from persons outside the University shall be required for those hired in fall of 2018 and onward. Per CUNY requirements:

All four-year degree-granting colleges in CUNY must ensure that faculty members pursuing tenure and/or promotion to associate or full professor are evaluated by peers in their discipline external to CUNY. In order to ensure fairness to faculty who have been hired under different standards and fairness to colleges that have not instituted such practices, this practice should commence with newly hired faculty in 2018-2019.

Guidelines for Identifying Possible External Peer Reviewers

- 10 external peer reviewers will be solicited to obtain 4 letters as follows:
 - The candidate will provide a list of no fewer than 5 but no more than 6 possible external peer reviewers they wish to evaluate them. The candidate can identify a list of those who should not be consulted, with reasons in writing.
 - The Departmental Personnel and Budget (P & B) Committee will provide a list of the additional 4-5 possible external peer reviewers.
 - The Departmental P & B and the candidates will provide a written rationale for their possible evaluators. *A key stipulation is that these evaluators not be friends, colleagues, collaborators, mentors, or co-authors of the candidate, or within the CUNY system.*
- The final list of 10 potential outside evaluators shall be submitted to the School Dean, indicating to the Dean which evaluators were suggested by the candidate and which evaluators were suggested by the Department P&B. This list is submitted for information only. The School Dean will send the request for evaluation to potential external peer reviewers using standardized letters (see Appendices A-C). No one other than the School Dean shall request the external evaluations from the external peer reviewers.
- All external evaluations that are received will become part of the candidate's portfolio.
- Letters of evaluation should be no more than 1-page long.

Materials to Be Provided to External Peer Reviewers

- MEC Guidelines for Promotion and Tenure
- Access to the applicants' tenure/promotion application and supporting materials

Criteria for External Peer Reviewers

Evaluators must:

- Be tenured.
- Be in the tenure/promotion candidate's discipline.
- Have scholarly accomplishments, which include recent publications (within the last 5 years) by reputable publishers and current research or activity in their field.
- Have community and/or international accomplishments or service
- *Be* teaching or affiliated with an accredited institution that offers 4-year baccalaureate degrees. External evaluators cannot be from institutions that only offer online degrees nor can their primary appointment be at a community college.
- Attests in the letter of evaluation itself that he or she knows of the candidate primarily through the candidate's work and not through a personal or professional relationship.
- Provide their C.V., which will be requested as part of the initial letter of request for evaluation.
- State explicitly whether they recommend tenure and/or promotion.

Timeline for Requesting Evaluations from External Peer Reviewers

- ***For Tenure Candidates:*** Invitations will be sent to potential external peer reviewers at the end of the spring semester prior to fall tenure applications but no sooner than **May 1st**. As such, candidates' tenure materials must be ready by the end of spring. External peer reviewers' letters are due back to the College by no later than **August 25**. It is recommended the potential external peer reviewers be identified during the semester prior to sending out invitations to potential reviewers.
- ***For Promotion Candidates:*** Invitations will be sent to potential external peer reviewers at the beginning of the fall semester prior to spring promotion applications. As such, candidates' promotion materials must be ready by the beginning of the fall. External peer reviewers' letters are due back to the College by the end of the fall semester. It is recommended the potential

external peer reviewers be identified during the semester prior to sending out invitations to potential reviewers.

Confidentiality of Letters from External Peer Reviewers

Academic Chairpersons, Deans, and OAA cannot share the external peer review letters directly with tenure and promotion candidates *unless the letters are deidentified and the reviewers' identifying details are redacted*. The identity of the writers should not be made public. This promise of deidentifying the letters prior to them being shared with the candidate is a way to ensure that reviewers will be candid. The deidentified letters must be included in the candidates' tenure and/or promotion application files.

Special Considerations

In cases where the candidate for promotion is a department Chair the School Dean shall provide guidance in the overall process.

Concurrent Promotion with Tenure

The committee recommends that promotion to Associate Professor be concurrent with the award of tenure.

Appendix A: External Peer Reviewer Request Letter for Tenure Candidates

Medgar Evers College Tenure and Promotion External Peer Review Request for Tenure Candidates

Dear XXXXX

The Personnel and Budget (P & B) Committee of the Department of _____ at Medgar Evers College, CUNY is considering Dr. / Mr. / Ms. _____ for tenure at his / her current of _____

The Personnel and Budget Committee of the Department is writing this letter to request your assistance in reviewing the accomplishments of the candidate for tenure.

To achieve tenure, the candidate is expected to meet the 9 points of tenure as outlined in the document, *Medgar Evers College Guidelines for the Faculty Regarding Reappointment, Promotion, and Tenure*. The tenure and promotion guidelines are enclosed as an attachment to inform your peer review and evaluation efforts.

The Faculty of Medgar Evers College and CUNY are represented by the Professional Staff Congress (PSC) a collective bargaining unit. The PSC has a contract with the Board of Trustees of the City University of New York. At Medgar Evers College and CUNY, a candidate's evaluation is based on the quality of contributions or achievement of the Nine Points of the PSC contract.

If you agree to provide a peer review of the candidate, The Committee will provide you with access to the candidate's application for tenure and accompanying documentation including a curriculum vita, publications, scholarship, and other supporting materials. Your candid evaluation of this candidate's work and accomplishments will be of great assistance to us in this important process.

Due consideration must be given to the accomplishments of the candidate since the candidate was first employed in the Department. When reviewing and evaluating the candidates work and when making your recommendations, please pay close attention to the mission of the College and the students we serve.

In written review, please begin your letter by describing your relationship with the candidate; whether you know the candidate, for how long, and in what context or capacity. Your evaluation of the quality and quantity of the candidate's achievements and the impact of his/her scholarship in teaching, research/creative activity, service/engagement, and outreach (if applicable) will be of considerable importance to us. In making our own decision, the P & B Committee will consider all the candidate's work and accomplishments. However, we request that you give special consideration to work completed while in their current rank in your review. Please indicate whether you recommend tenure for the candidate.

The review should not exceed 1 page in length. Your letter will be treated as confidential and access to your original letter will be restricted to those involved in the promotion and tenure review process.

If you are willing to serve as an external reviewer, we thank you in advance. Promotion and tenure decisions are among the most important activities that we do within the university and your help is

greatly appreciated. We ask that you email Dean XXX @mec.cuny.edu with your decision by DATE. To make full use of your comments, review letters should be returned no later than _____ (Date).

Please include your curriculum vita for use by the reviewers at the college as an introduction to you.

Medgar Evers College of the City University of New York is a comprehensive Senior College of the City University of New York. The College's mission is to develop and maintain high quality, professional, career oriented undergraduate degree programs in the context of liberal education. The College offers programs both at the baccalaureate and at the associate degree levels, giving close attention to the articulation between the two year and the four-year programs.

**If there is a conflict of interest with the candidate or Medgar Evers College, please decline the request to review. **

Appendix B: External Peer Reviewer Request Letter for Assistant Professors Being Considered for Tenure and Concurrent Promotion

**Medgar Evers College Tenure and Promotion External Peer Review Request for Assistant Professors Being Considered for Tenure and Concurrent Promotion
(Tenure Assistant Professor – Promotion)**

Dear XXXXX

The Personnel and Budget Committee (P & B) of the Department of _____ at Medgar Evers College, CUNY is considering the tenure and promotion of _____ from Assistant Professor to the rank of Associate professor

The Personnel and Budget Committee of the Department is writing this letter to request your assistance in reviewing the accomplishments of the candidate for Tenure (promotion (or promotion and tenure, or tenure).

To achieve tenure and concurrent promotion, the candidate is expected to meet the 9 points of tenure as outlined in the document, *Medgar Evers College Guidelines for the Faculty Regarding Reappointment, Promotion, and Tenure*. The tenure and promotion guidelines are enclosed as an attachment to inform your peer review and evaluation efforts.

Please note that, a candidate who is an assistant professor and is reappointed with tenure, is automatically promoted to Associate Professor. Therefore, you must consider this factor in evaluating the candidate to be reappointed with tenure if the candidate is an assistant professor. To achieve promotion from Assistant Professor to Associate Professor, the candidate is expected to meet the criteria as outlined in the *Medgar Evers College Guidelines for the Faculty Regarding Reappointment, Promotion, and Tenure*.

The Faculty of Medgar Evers College and CUNY are represented by the Professional Staff Congress (PSC), a collective bargaining unit. The PSC has a contract with the Board of Trustees of the City University of New York. At Medgar Evers College and CUNY, a candidate's evaluation is based on the quality of contributions or achievement of the Nine Points of the PSC contract.

If you agree to provide a peer review of the candidate, The Committee will provide you with access to the candidate's application for tenure and accompanying documentation including a curriculum vita, publications, scholarship, and other supporting materials. Your candid evaluation of this candidate's work and accomplishments will be of great assistance to us in this important process.

In reviewing and evaluating the candidate's application and supporting materials, and in making your recommendations, please pay close attention to the mission of the College and the students that are served.

In written review, please begin your letter by describing your relationship with the candidate; whether

you know the candidate, for how long, and in what context or capacity. Your evaluation of the quality and quantity of the candidate's achievements and the impact of his/her scholarship in teaching, research/creative activity, service/engagement, and outreach (if applicable) will be of considerable importance to us. In making our own decision, the P & B Committee will consider all the candidate's work and accomplishments. However, we request that you give special consideration to work completed while in their current rank in your review. Please indicate whether you recommend tenure and promotion for the candidate.

The review should not exceed 1 page in length. Your letter will be treated as confidential and access to your original letter will be restricted to those involved in the promotion and tenure review process.

If you are willing to serve as an external reviewer, we thank you in advance. Promotion and tenure decisions are among the most important activities that we do within the university and your help is greatly appreciated. We ask that you email Dean XXX @mec.cuny.edu with your decision by **DATE**. To make full use of your comments, review letters should be returned no later than _____ (Date).

Please include your curriculum vita for use by the reviewers at the college as an introduction to you.

Medgar Evers College of the City University of New York is a comprehensive Senior College of the City University of New York. The College's mission is to develop and maintain high quality, professional, career oriented undergraduate degree programs in the context of liberal education. The College offers programs both at the baccalaureate and at the associate degree levels, giving close attention to the articulation between the two year and the four-year programs.

****If there is a conflict of interest with the candidate or Medgar Evers College, please decline the request to review. ****

Appendix C: External Peer Reviewers Request Letter for Associate Professors Being Considered for Promotion to Full Professor

Medgar Evers College Tenure and Promotion External Peer Review Request for Associate Professors Being Considered for Promotion to Full Professor

Dear XXXXX

The Personnel and Budget (P & B) Committee of the Department of _____ at Medgar Evers College, CUNY is considering the promotion of _____ from the rank of Associate Professor to the rank of Full Professor

The Personnel and Budget Committee of the Department is writing this letter to request your assistance in reviewing the accomplishments of the candidate for Tenure (promotion (or promotion and tenure, or tenure).

To achieve promotion from Associate Professor to Full Professor, the candidate is expected to meet the criteria as outlined in the *Medgar Evers College Guidelines for the Faculty Regarding Reappointment, Promotion, and Tenure*. The promotion guidelines are enclosed as an attachment to inform your peer review and evaluation efforts.

If you agree to provide a peer review of the candidate, The Committee will provide you with access to the candidate's application for tenure and accompanying documentation including a curriculum vita, publications, scholarship, and other supporting materials. Your candid evaluation of this candidate's work and accomplishments will be of great assistance to us in this important process. In reviewing and evaluating the candidates works and in making your recommendations, please pay close attention to the mission of the College and the students that are served.

In written review, please begin your letter by describing your relationship with the candidate; whether you know the candidate, for how long, and in what context or capacity. Your evaluation of the quality and quantity of the candidate's achievements and the impact of his/her scholarship in teaching, research/creative activity, service/engagement, and outreach (if applicable) will be of considerable importance to us. In making our own decision, the P & B Committee will consider all the candidate's work and accomplishments. However, we request that you give special consideration to work completed while in their current rank in your review. Please indicate whether you recommend promotion for the candidate.

The review should not exceed 1 page in length. Your letter will be treated as confidential and access to your original letter will be restricted to those involved in the promotion and tenure review process.

If you are willing to serve as an external reviewer, we thank you in advance. Promotion and tenure decisions are among the most important activities that we do within the university and your help is greatly appreciated. We ask that you email Dean XXX @mec.cuny.edu with your decision by DATE. To make full use of your comments, review letters should be returned no later than _____. (Date).

Please include your curriculum vita for use by the reviewers at the college as an introduction to you.

Medgar Evers College of the City University of New York is a comprehensive Senior College of the City University of New York. The College's mission is to develop and maintain high quality, professional, career oriented undergraduate degree programs in the context of liberal education. The College offers programs both at the baccalaureate and at the associate degree levels, giving close attention to the articulation between the two year and the four-year programs.

****If there is a conflict of interest with the candidate or Medgar Evers College, please decline the request to review. ****

Medgar Evers College Tenure and Promotion Review Committee Members

The following individuals drafted and contributed to establishing the guidelines outlined in this document:

- Dr. Hollie Jones (Chair)
- Dr. Chinyere Emmanuel Egbe
- Dr. Ken Hoyte
- Dr. Sheldon Huggins
- Dr. Fabienne Snowden
- Moses Phillips
- Dr. Sheilah Paul
- Dr. Clinton Crawford